Media Coverage and Car Manufacturers’ Sales

Ralf Dewenter, Ulrich Heimeshoff, Tobias Thomas

March 2016
Abstract
A wide range of media provide information on many products based on reviews or expert opinions. The effects of such information on product sales is analyzed in a small but growing literature in economics and marketing science. However, there is much more coverage on companies and products in the media than product reviews and expert opinions. Based on a unique dataset, we test whether coverage of car manufacturers in opinion leading media have significant impact on registrations of new cars in Germany. We find that positive (or at least neutral) media coverage has statistically significant effect on the number of new cars sold by several leading manufacturers on the German car market.
1 Introduction

Consumers’ purchasing decisions largely depend on information provided by the media. On one hand media coverage has a significant impact on the consumer confidence in general (see, Alsem et al, 2008, or Kholodilin et al, 2015). On the other hand such information can be product related as online reviews of books and movies or reviews in car magazines or expert opinions on wines or restaurants (see, e.g., Dewenter and Heimeshoff, 2016, Reuter, 2009, or Zhu and Zhang, 2010). However, not each report in the media related to certain companies is also related to products’ characteristics, qualities or prices. Especially in the news media there is very often general coverage on companies, not focused on single products but on, e.g., general strategies, management, finance or environmental, social or governmental activities of the enterprise. A recent example is the much debated scandal of German car manufacturer Volkswagen manipulating emissions of its Diesel engines on test runs. Some of the reporting related to this scandal deals with certain products, engines as well as cars, produced by Volkswagen.

The literature provides some evidence that product related coverage, for example expert opinions or reviews in magazines, may or may not have impact on consumers’ buying decisions (see e.g. Eliashberg and Shugan, 1997; Reinstein and Snyder, 2005; Sorensen and Rasmussen, 2004; and Clement et al., 2008). A different strand of the literature analyzes the effects of reviews on wine demand (see Friberg and Grönqvist, 2012; Hilger et al., 2011; Ashenfelter and Jones, 2013). Another strand of the literature deals with financial products. In magazines and newspapers dealing with financial topics, recommendations and evaluations of certain financial instruments have a long tradition. As a result, the literature on recommendations of financial products is significantly larger than on media products and food (see Sirri and Tuffano, 1996; Jain and Wu, 2000; Cronquist, 2004; and Reuter and Zitzewitz, 2006).

The research question of this paper is to what extend general information influences consumers’ purchasing decisions as well. Testing the effects of general media reporting on firms and prices is relatively rare. One exception is the long tradition in financial economics of testing the effects of news on prices in financial markets. These tests are regularly implemented as event studies (see MacKinlay, 1997) dealing, for example, with the effects of merger announcements on asset prices. But also in political science the effects of media coverage, for example on elections, are studied extensively (see, e.g., Lawson and McCann, 2005).

Our paper intends to fill this research gap and for this reason, we analyze the impact of media coverage in opinion leading newspapers and television channels in Germany on new cars’ registrations using panel data techniques by regressing the manufacturers’ numbers of new registrations on measures of media coverage, which is classified as positive, negative, and neutral, as well as on some controls. The following section describes our dataset. Section 3 reports the results from our statistical analysis and section 4 concludes.
2 Data

We utilize a unique dataset including media coverage in German opinion leading media from Media Tenor International. In general, swiss-based Media Tenor International analyzes a broad range of international opinion-leading media, including TV news programs, newspaper, magazines, business media, radio as well as social media with regard to all possible protagonists, such as persons (politicians, entrepreneurs, managers, celebrities, etc.) and institutions (political parties, companies, football clubs, etc.). Each of these news items is analyzed for instance with regard to the topic mentioned (foreign policy, HR, unemployment, business strategy, etc.) as well as with regard to the tone of the information (negative, positive or neutral).

For the analysis provided here we did concentrate on media coverage in German opinion leading media, inclusive seven TV newscasts, seven newspapers, and five weeklies and two business media (see the appendix for a detailed list), on 37 car manufacturers4 from March 2001 to October 2011 (see Table 1 for descriptive statistics). Here, the tone of the information reflects if a manufacturer is mentioned in positive, neutral or negative way.

To approximate monthly car sales, we used data on new car registrations provided by the German Federal Office of Motor Vehicles (Kraftfahrzeugbundesamt). Additionally, to account for variations in new car registrations due to general business cycle fluctuations, we include the ifo business cycle indicator, which is published on a monthly basis by one of Germany’s leading economics research institutes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Descriptive Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registrations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ifo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3 Results

To analyze the impact of media coverage on new car registrations we run simple fixed effects panel regressions as well as dynamic fixed effects models (see Wooldridge, 2010). We estimate dynamic models using simple fixed effects regressions. As the time dimension of our

---

4 That is Alfa Romeo, Audi, BMW, Chevrolet, Chrysler, Citroen, Daihatsu, Ferrari, Fiat, Ford, Honda, Hyundai, Jaguar, Jeep, Kia, Lancia, Land Rover, Lexus, Maserati, Mazda, Mercedes Benz, Mitsubishi, Nissan, Opel, Peugeot, Porsche, Renault, Rover, Saab, Seat, Skoda, Smart, Subaru, Suzuki, Toyota, Volvo, VW.
panel is relatively large, we do not expect a significant Nickell bias when using fixed effects regression with a lagged dependent variable (see Pesaran, 2015).

As presented in Table 2, dynamic fixed effects models (FE II and FE IV) provide some evidence for a significant impact of general information on sales. Using all reports (positive, neutral and negative) as an explanatory variable, a positive and statistically significant impact on registrations can be found (FE II). Each report increases the number of new registrations by about 1.2 cars, which is quite a significant number. Using positive and neutral reports on car manufacturers instead of all reports leads to very similar results (FE IV). An additional report increases the number of registrations by about 1.6. This result seems natural as good news on manufacturers’ are more likely to attract consumers to buy their products than bad news. In both regressions the model fits the data quite well.

### Table 2: Fixed Effects Regressions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FE I Reg</th>
<th>FE II Reg</th>
<th>FE III Reg</th>
<th>FE IV Reg</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Registrations(_t) (-1)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.9460***</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>.9460***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00)</td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports(_t)</td>
<td>4.88</td>
<td>1.22</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.51)</td>
<td>(0.00)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive+Neutral(_t)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>6.59</td>
<td>1.57***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(0.19)</td>
<td>(0.00)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>If(_t)</td>
<td>-136.63</td>
<td>-20.14</td>
<td>-136.33</td>
<td>-20.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.34)</td>
<td>(0.28)</td>
<td>(0.34)</td>
<td>(0.28)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time dummies</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>20434.53</td>
<td>1706.59</td>
<td>20395.03</td>
<td>1698.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.16)</td>
<td>(0.30)</td>
<td>(0.16)</td>
<td>(0.30)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R2 (within)</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-Test</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>1299</td>
<td>3.88</td>
<td>1670</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(0.00)</td>
<td>(0.00)</td>
<td>(0.00)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Obs</td>
<td>4,666</td>
<td>4,629</td>
<td>4,666</td>
<td>4,629</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td># of Groups</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Heteroscedasticity consistent clustered standard errors are given in parentheses. ***, **, * representing 1, 5, and 10% levels of confidence.
Our results are in line with recent news reports on sales drops related to the Volkswagen scandal. After manipulations of emissions tests were broadly covered in the U.K. media, Volkswagen sales in the U.K. dropped by 20% in November 2015. These anecdotal evidence shows that consumers react to general, non-product specific, media coverage on companies. Many cars produced by Volkswagen, for example all cars equipped with petrol engines, are not affected by the manipulation of Diesel engines. However, customers buying decisions are nevertheless affected by these news, whether indirectly relevant or even relevant.

4 Conclusions

Consumers typically base their decisions on information about prices and other product characteristics. Media outlets, either in terms of advertising or as editorial content, usually provide such information. However, not every report in the media also contains information on products. Especially in the news media there is rather a general coverage of companies, focusing on general strategies, management, finance or environmental, social or governmental activities of enterprises. In order to analyze the impact of general news on consumer behavior, we run dynamic fixed effects regressions to determine the impact of media coverage on new cars' registrations. Overall, we find a positive and significant number of sales influenced by the news. An additional report per month leads to about 1.2 more registrations. In case that reports have a positive (or at least neutral) tonality, the effect is even higher. Not only product specific information but also general news therefore have a rather strong impact on consumer behavior.

---

5 An analysis of 5.332 reports on automotive companies in TV-newsshow from Germany, Spain, Switzerland, UK and US (January 2012 – November 2015) provided by Media Tenor shows that in contrast to the US the UK media coverage on the VW-Dieselgate massively exceeded the awareness threshold. After this, the VW-sales in the UK dropped massively (http://www.theguardian.com/business/2015/dec/04/vw-sales-drop-uk-new-car-registrations).

6 The effects of irrelevant information on decision making is studied extensively in economics and psychology. See, e.g., Kahneman and Tversky (1974).
References


## Appendix

**Table A: Media Outlets**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TV</th>
<th>Newspaper</th>
<th>Weeklies</th>
<th>Business media</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ARD Tagesschau</td>
<td>Bild-Zeitung</td>
<td>Focus</td>
<td>ManagerMagazin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ARD Tagesthemen</td>
<td>Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung (FAZ)</td>
<td>Frankfurter Allgemeine Sonntagszeitung (FAS)</td>
<td>Wirtschaftswoche</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pro 7 Nachrichten</td>
<td>Frankfurter Rundschau</td>
<td>Spiegel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTL AKTUELL</td>
<td>Rheinischer Merkur</td>
<td>Stern</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAT.1 18:30</td>
<td>Süddeutsche Zeitung</td>
<td>Welt</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZDF heute</td>
<td>Taz</td>
<td>Welt am Sonntag</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZDF heute journal</td>
<td>Welt</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PREVIOUS DISCUSSION PAPERS


214 Dertwinkel-Kalt, Markus and Riener, Gerhard, A First Test of Focusing Theory, February 2016.


205 Dauth, Wolfgang, Findeisen, Sebastian and Suedekum, Jens, Adjusting to Globalization – Evidence from Worker-Establishment Matches in Germany, January 2016.

204 Banerjee, Debosree, Ibañez, Marcela, Riener, Gerhard and Wollni, Meike, Volunteering to Take on Power: Experimental Evidence from Matrilineal and Patriarchal Societies in India, November 2015.


201 Demeulemeester, Sarah and Hottenrott, Hanna, R&D Subsidies and Firms’ Cost of Debt, November 2015.


193 Defever, Fabrice, Fischer, Christian and Suedekum, Jens, Relational Contracts and Supplier Turnover in the Global Economy, August 2015.


191 Ciani, Andrea and Bartoli, Francesca, Export Quality Upgrading under Credit Constraints, July 2015.


184 Amess, Kevin, Stiebale, Joel and Wright, Mike, The Impact of Private Equity on Firms’ Innovation Activity, April 2015. Forthcoming in: European Economic Review.


181 Baumann, Florian and Friehle, Tim, Proof beyond a Reasonable Doubt: Laboratory Evidence, March 2015.


178 Buchwald, Achim and Hottenrott, Hanna, Women on the Board and Executive Duration – Evidence for European Listed Firms, February 2015.


174 Buchwald, Achim, Competition, Outside Directors and Executive Turnover: Implications for Corporate Governance in the EU, February 2015.

173 Buchwald, Achim and Thorwarth, Susanne, Outside Directors on the Board, Competition and Innovation, February 2015.


171 Haucap, Justus, Heimeshoff, Ulrich and Siekmann, Manuel, Price Dispersion and Station Heterogeneity on German Retail Gasoline Markets, January 2015.


169 Nowak, Verena, Organizational Decisions in Multistage Production Processes, December 2014.


165 Gu, Yiquan, Rasch, Alexander and Wenzel, Tobias, Price-sensitive Demand and Market Entry, November 2014
Forthcoming in: Papers in Regional Science.

164 Caprice, Stéphane, von Schlippenbach, Vanessa and Wey, Christian, Supplier Fixed Costs and Retail Market Monopolization, October 2014.

163 Klein, Gordon J. and Wendel, Julia, The Impact of Local Loop and Retail Unbundling Revisited, October 2014.


160 Behrens, Kristian, Mion, Giordano, Murata, Yasusada and Suedekum, Jens, Spatial Frictions, September 2014.


158 Stiebale, Joel, Cross-Border M&As and Innovative Activity of Acquiring and Target Firms, August 2014.


Forthcoming in: Telecommunications Policy.

155 Baumann, Florian and Friehhe, Tim, On Discovery, Restricting Lawyers, and the Settlement Rate, August 2014.


Forthcoming in: Studies in Higher Education.


149 Kholodilin, Konstantin A., Thomas, Tobias and Ulbricht, Dirk, Do Media Data Help to Predict German Industrial Production?, July 2014.


144 Jeitschko, Thomas D., Jung, Yeonjei and Kim, Jaesoo, Bundling and Joint Marketing by Rival Firms, May 2014.


142 Dauth, Wolfgang and Suedekum, Jens, Globalization and Local Profiles of Economic Growth and Industrial Change, April 2014.

141 Nowak, Verena, Schwarz, Christian and Suedekum, Jens, Asymmetric Spiders: Supplier Heterogeneity and the Organization of Firms, April 2014.

140 Hasnas, Irina, A Note on Consumer Flexibility, Data Quality and Collusion, April 2014.

139 Baye, Irina and Hasnas, Irina, Consumer Flexibility, Data Quality and Location Choice, April 2014.


Older discussion papers can be found online at:
http://ideas.repec.org/s/zbw/dicedp.html